
**The Political Economy of Muslim Identity in 411 Action by Online Media
(Semiotic Analysis of Tribunnews Journalists Reports on Youtube)**

Khairul Syafuddin

Faculty of Communication Science, Sahid University, Jakarta

Correspondence: khairul.syafuddin@usahid.ac.id

Abstract

The People's Defenders National Movement (GNPR) held the 411 Action to demand President Jokowi step down from his position. Even though the action was in the name of defending the people, it contained the practice of Muslim identity politics. This Muslim identity can be exploited by the media to reap benefits from the audience. The theory in this research is propaganda and commodification. The purpose of this study is to analyze Tribunnews' efforts to make a profit in the context of political economy. This study uses qualitative methods through semiotic analysis of Roland Barthes. The results of this study see that Muslim identities tend to be displayed in Tribunnews live reports. Setting the point of view of the journalist's camera makes Muslim identity a spectacle material to be used as a commodity material. In addition, the selection of action images also strengthened the propaganda message of the demonstration. There are various signs displayed in the live report, such as white cloth clothes, caps, and other clothes that symbolize Islamic religious identity. In addition to commodification, there are propaganda practices carried out through this media. Propaganda practices are carried out to build a position between the protagonist and antagonist through broadcasts on Youtube.

Keywords: *commodification, identity politics, muslim, propaganda, tribunnews*

INTRODUCTION

Social phenomena that are always associated with Islam often appear in Indonesia. This cannot be separated from the majority of the population in Indonesia who embrace Islam. Many then take advantage of the issue of religion in Indonesia to get votes from the partisans as part of a political contestation that is full of ambition and momentary interests (Umam & Sulaeman, 2022: 2). This interest is then used by many layers of society who have interests. Both from the government, business people, to the media which are the mouthpieces of information. When an issue about religion begins to be widely discussed in society, the media will take part in disseminating this information widely. Of course this is related to their interests in the context of

political economy. Where the mass media will continue to try to take advantage of all issues, especially religion to get big profits.

One of the private media that has wide power and fame in Indonesia is Tribunnews. Known from the profile Tribun Group of Regional Newspaper on the linkedin.com portal that Tribunnews is the only online news portal that has the largest regional news channel in Indonesia. Based on the data written, there are 23 online news channels and the media has more than 1.1 million daily visitors. This shows that people's interest in seeing the news portal is quite high. Thus the level of public trust in the information conveyed can be said to be quite high.

Tribunnews does not only spread news or information through website portals. However, the published news has also been integrated through the YouTube channel. With this integration, Tribunnews does not only provide news through online news portals in the form of written text. But the news portal also provides information in video form. Both from coverage made in the form of recordings to special coverage live on location.

One of the reports from Tribunnews on Youtube which received considerable attention related to the 411 action. News videos Tribunnews which was broadcast on Youtube on November 4, 2022 ago reporting issues related to the action of the National People's Defender Movement (GNPR) 411. The action took place in the Horse Statue Roundabout area, Gambir, Central Jakarta. Based on data reported by Tribunnews, the action was carried out by means of a long march which started at 12.30 WIB and arrived at the Horse Statue area at 14.00 WIB. From the news that was conveyed in the news, it was known that this action demanded President Joko Widodo (Jokowi) to resign from this position. In fact, it was also explained that the message contained in the banner brought in the 411 action. The banner said that it was written "*kami yakin umat Islam yang datang dari seluruh Indonesia di 411 bukan hanya sekedar membela agama, tetapi membela bangsa dan negara*".

Based on this information, it can be seen that the efforts of the demonstrators who carried out the 411 action also raised the issue of the Islamic religious movement. This is also reinforced by the visuals shown in the Tribunnews news where the social actors in it wear clothes that identify themselves as Muslims. Dugal dan Bholey (2019) explained that clothing or fashion can be used to build an individual's identity. In this case the clothes worn by someone who has a certain value or meaning can not only provide affirmation for those who interpret it. However, it can also be used to measure the manifestation of the identity of the wearer.

Wearing clothing that symbolizes Muslims certainly emphasizes a meaning for the interests of a group. Through clothing, an individual or group can also build a representation of the party they represent. The practice of political representation occurs because there is a dominant party

represented in a social and political phenomenon (Preston, 2009: 65). In the 411 action, there is a dominant ideology that a group of social actors is trying to bring out. This is ultimately seen as a communication system where the meaning built can be accepted and understood in the cultural context in Indonesia.

The existence of efforts from the politics of religious representation cannot be separated from the presence of the media which continues to frame events to be published to the public. Butsch emphasized that representation can work well and justify the existence of class relations in the context of modern capitalism (Kellner & Share, 2019: 3). When information is now easier to disseminate and receive by the public via the internet, it is easier to find political interests framed in this representational practice. A group of individuals can demonstrate their practice of claiming their group as a representation of a society and this is captured by the media. Representations that occur can ultimately be used and exploited by certain media to take part in benefiting from the efforts made by social actors.

In this case, of course, many media capture the phenomenon of the 411 action as a commodity that can provide benefits for the media. Not only mass media or online media like Tribunnews. Many other national media, even local media based in Jakarta, are taking advantage of this issue as an information commodity that can bring huge profits. This happens because in the practice of media political economy there is a commodification process that is carried out. Vincent Mosco explained that commodification is seen as a process of changing use value into exchange or economic value (Adi, Sujoko, & Antoni, 2021: 44). The media can carry out this commodification practice because it has the power to change the value of the information function into an economic advantage for companies and media capitalism. In the end, the information services provided by the media can be seen as an attempt to take advantage of a phenomenon or event to turn it into a profit.

The current process of commodification of information can run smoothly because of the support from media facilities supported by the internet network. In this research, Tribunnews becomes the object of study to explain this process through journalists' coverage of the phenomenon of the 411 action. It is important to understand and realize that efforts to commodify information with religious nuances that carry out political actions always receive high attention from the public. This can also be seen from the public's interest in the information presented by Tribunnews. Based on data obtained on November 19, 2022, this information was watched by 62,892 viewers on the Tribunnews Youtube account. In addition, there were 568 comments written by the viewers in the comments column.

As a mass media that has been integrated through the internet on the YouTube channel, of course this information can be a tool for propaganda to the public. This is because propaganda has traditionally been seen as something closely related to media channels, both mass media such as radio, television, films and newspapers (Farkas & Neumayer, 2020). Herman & Chomsky (1988) argues that propaganda is a phenomenon that requires mass media collaboration in the process of conveying information. Changes in the practice of using information and communication technology have also changed propaganda practices. With the internet, propaganda can be done at a lower cost and more easily. Even media that engage in this practice can generate more profits than they need to invest. This is because the internet makes it easy for the media industry to disseminate information.

The ease of media commodification and propaganda is then seen as a form of political economy in the era of digital capitalism. In the end, the practice of digital capitalism is seen to continue to show its strength, especially in this context by utilizing the action of 411 packaged through religious values. Both in verbal and non-verbal messages. Therefore, this study aims to analyze 'Tribunnews' efforts to make a profit in the context of the political economy of the media. This research has limitations in the process of analysis, namely focusing on the commodification context associated with propaganda practices in new media. In addition, this research is also expected to add insight, views, and can contribute to increasing knowledge in the field of new media studies.

This study uses a critical paradigm to analyze the findings of the text which is the object of study. The researcher focuses on the topic of text study taken in Tribunnews YouTube content regarding news from its journalists entitled "*Suasana Massa Aksi GNPR 411 yang Padati Kawasan Bundaran Patung Kuda Tuntut Jokowi untuk Mundur*". In the process of conducting the analysis, the researcher focuses on the verbal text of the message conveyed by the journalist, as well as the non-verbal text of the visual observations taken in the video.

The analysis technique used by researchers is semiotic analysis through the approach offered by Roland Barthes. Through this analysis technique, the researcher interprets the data through the process of interpreting denotations, connotations, and myths. In this process of denotation and connotation, the researcher conducts an analysis through the process of determining the signifier and signified both at the denotation and connotation levels. In this process, denotation signs can be said as the first system and connotations as the second system in the process of semiotic analysis.

This semiotic analysis is carried out in two stages (Sobur dalam Wibisono & Sari, 2021: 33). At the first level (denotation) the researcher analyzes the language problems that appear in the

coverage. In this case the researcher sees the relation of reality which is manifested in the form of a sign so that it can be analyzed at the second level (connotation). At the connotation level, the researcher sees that the sign is associated with the culture in society. The connection between this sign and culture is seen not only in terms of connotation, but also through myths. Roland Barthes (Rahmawati, 2017: 4) argues that myths can be found through 3 dimensions of signifier, signified, and sign. Myth can be seen as a special system built from pre-existing semiological chains. Therefore the existence of myths in the process of semiotic analysis has an important role in this research process.

RESEARCH METHOD

In this study, the researcher used a form of descriptive qualitative research, which is research conducted to describe or explain a phenomenon by using scientific procedures to answer. Qualitative research is carried out on natural objects that develop as they are, not manipulated by researchers and the presence of researchers does not actually have an affect the dynamics on that object (Wijayanto & Iswari, 2021).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Journalist Communication Process in Live Update

Communication is an activity that is always carried out by humans as social beings. This communication activity is inseparable from the various interests that everyone has, both for work purposes and in everyday life. In the act of communication carried out by humans, there is a process that needs to be passed so that a message can be conveyed properly. In this case the process of the ongoing act of communication, especially in conveying important information to be understood.

Sapienza, Iyer, dan Veenstra (2015: 608) explains that there are 5 concepts that need to be understood in the communication model offered by Harold Lasswell. The five concepts are communicators, messages, media, communicants, and the effects they cause. These five concepts become a process that cannot be separated in the practice of communicating for every human being, either through certain communication media technologies or direct (face to face) communication.

In this study, the communication process that occurs is communication that uses the Youtube channel to convey information widely. Thus it can be seen that in the communication process carried out by Tribunnews journalists as a communicator mediated by communication technology to convey messages to the public (communicants). The communication process

certainly has the possibility to run smoothly or not smoothly. This is one of them caused by the quality of the media or the network used.

The practice of mass communication carried out by Tribunnews journalists is known to experience noise or interference when the message is delivered. The noise occurs as a result of the technology used. The result is that there is an unclear verbal message for the information it conveys. This causes an imbalance between the words of news anchors and the words conveyed by field journalists. The imbalance in this case is related to the clarity and ambiguity of the information conveyed by the two social actors. News anchor Tribunnews can convey its message clearly through the equipment provided in the media studio. Meanwhile, field journalists are tasked with conveying information using makeshift tools, so that there are obstacles in the process of conveying information to the communicant.

The problem is whether the message conveyed is clear or not, of course it has an influence on the capture of the message that can be carried out by the communicant. This can affect the effects that occur from the communicant, which in this case is the public which becomes the mass of 411 action information. Karam (2009; Rusadi, 2012: 113) describes three scenarios related to journalism in the information society era, including broad opportunities for people to receive and convey information, speed in reporting social phenomena that occur, and lack of information that creates information needs. In relation to these three scenarios, speed is an aspect that can be focused on to look at the occurrence of technological obstacles that occur on the Tribunnews live report.

Online media has demands not only as a medium to present facts, but also demands in terms of speed, skill, and creativity that must be expressed in various platforms (Muliawanti, 2018: 88). This makes the use of simple but powerful tools, such as smartphones to do coverage, often encountered when journalists are doing coverage. Whether the coverage is done live or not. The use of smartphones for journalists can be said to be able to answer these challenges and to keep up with the times. The use of these tools is also able to reduce costs from the media because there is no need to issue complex equipment. Besides that, smartphones connected to the internet allow journalists to do live reports which are directly displayed by the media through their studios.

The simplicity of the equipment used certainly has its drawbacks. This is shown from the live reports of Tribunnews journalists where there is noise and unclear sound during the coverage. This condition can certainly lead to the emergence of miscommunication from the public as the communicant, where they cannot clearly hear the report submitted by the journalist. The presence of noise can affect the effect of communication that occurs. Such as the lack of public

understanding of the information being disseminated or the incomplete information being captured, as a result the decoding process that occurs in the communicant does not run smoothly.

This effect for a media that supplies information to the public is certainly an important thing to pay attention to. Especially when the question from the news anchor became the trigger for the journalist's explanation to sound clearer. This can increase public curiosity. Especially when in its coverage the public is presented with visuals full of religious (Islamic) symbols. The large number of religious symbols captured by the public through the visuals presented can raise questions when the verbal communication that journalists need to convey cannot be well received.

However, Tribunnews has made efforts through the YouTube channel to complete the information it conveys. This is done by completing information through the description column in the live report content. The information provided in the video content description column contains written news which is the result of the coverage that has been carried out. The efforts made by Tribunnews are a form of media integration practice between publications on the online media portal tribunnews.com and the Tribunnews Youtube channel. This media integration is an effort that can complement and overcome the noise that arises from journalists' coverage. This practice of integrating media can ultimately be seen as an attempt by communicators to complement message or information content to create certain effects and suppress information noise.

Commodification of Islamic Religion Through Visual News

The information published by Tribunnews through its Youtube channel does not only prioritize verbal communication. In the information disseminated by the media, there is an emphasis on messages that are informed in the form of non-verbal communication. This can be seen from the efforts of Tribunnews, both editors in the studio and field journalists when producing the live report content. In this case the workers from the media construct visual information in the form of signs that have certain symbols in a community group.

The dominant sign shown in the live report which lasts more than 8 minutes shows more symbols of the Islamic religion. This can be seen from the clothes worn by the demonstrators who carried out the 411 action. In the first phase of the semiotic analysis process (denotation) the sign that can be seen is the white clothes worn by the demonstrators. The signifier at this denotation level is the white cloth worn by social actors. Then for the signified at this denotation level is Muslim clothing.

In the second stage of semiotic analysis (denotation) Muslim clothing (as signifier) is seen as a symbol for Muslims (people who embrace Islam). This was shown from the various clothes

worn by the demonstrators, ranging from head coverings, shirts, to white pants or sarongs. Although not all demonstrators wore clothes in such an order, some of the demonstrators who attended also wore one of these religious symbols. For example, a demonstrator wears neat clothes, but still wears a white head covering (*cap/peci*). There were also demonstrators who wore koko clothes with sarongs. Where these various visuals appear in the coverage framing presented by Tribunnews. The dominance of clothing that includes Muslim symbols creates a construction of meaning that the action is part of the movement of the Muslim community.

The white cloth which is then interpreted as a symbol of Muslims cannot be separated from the existence of myths in this semiotic process. All objects can become myths when they contain messages and within them there is a running communication system (Yelly, 2019: 122). White cloth or white clothing which initially had no meaning, has now been interpreted by certain religious symbols. In this case the white cloth has been interpreted as a symbol of Muslims. The meaning of the white cloth as a symbol of Muslim attire is due to the history when actions in the name of Islam appear in the media, the religious symbol that is often highlighted is clothing which is dominated by white. Visually, when religious symbols are shown through the media to the public, it can be said that this is an attempt to carry out da'wah (Rustandi, 2018: 212). This da'wah symbol continues to be shown through the media as part of the message the demonstrators want to convey. When this is done massively and consistently, the myth that white clothes are a symbol of Muslims becomes even stronger.

The power of this religious symbol is well captured by the media, in this case Tribunnews, to be published and produced as coverage content. Tribunnews captures this phenomenon and presents it in a live report content that is broadcast via its YouTube channel. Media construction when presenting information certainly has its own purpose and importance, especially when taking the framing and point of view of the information to be presented. This is related to the political economy efforts of a media to benefit from the commodity information it presents.

In this case Tribunnews takes the opportunity to spread information by commodifying religious symbols that are taken visually. This can be seen from the two visuals presented by Tribunnews in the live report content. First, field journalists cover by taking videos using the front camera of a smartphone. The video was taken mobile by utilizing the visual background of the demonstrators' condition. The shooting technique carried out by the Tribunnews field journalist allowed him to focus on the visuals of the current condition of the demonstrators. This coverage technique allows Tribunnews to provide up-to-date reports on the ground (live) on the conditions that were happening at the time. Although from the live report shown, it can be seen that the action did not look too solid (it tends to look like it has been completed).

However, in the second visual, you can see the re-recording being broadcast through the studio of the action that took place. In this video it is shown that the action looks very solid. The mass density is very visible because it is supported by the framing and the point of view of the video taken. This makes the repetition or repetition of the emphasis on Islamic religious symbols or Muslims getting stronger. This effort also does not escape the role of Tribunnews in carrying out the practice of commodifying messages focused on religious symbols.



Figure 1. Visual live report Tribunnews on Youtube

Source: www.youtube.com

Religious symbols packaged in the form of live reports by Tribunnews to be commodified are getting stronger due to several questions from news anchors. The question that strengthens this is related to the presence of Habib Rizieq Shihab's son-in-law, namely Habib Hanif Al Attas in the action. This question further strengthens the Muslim symbol that has been shown through the video coverage. The existence of Habib Hanif Al Attas can ultimately be seen as a sign that strengthens the religious values presented in this coverage. This is because Habib Rizieq Shihab himself has strong symbolic value as a representation of Muslims. When he is not present, the previously strong symbolic value switches to Habib Hanif Al Attas. This shift in the value of Muslim representation is clearly shown by the mention of Habib Hanif Al Attas as the son-in-law of Habib Rizieq Shihab who was present at the 411 action.

Construction of messages verbally or non-verbally through existing signs is part of Tribunnews' efforts to commodify information. There are two things to note in this phenomenon. First, the value of information that can be converted into economic value through this coverage. Second, religious values are strengthened in the construction of messages from the 411 action which are also packaged as information commodities. Both of these things can turn into economic value with advertisements that enter Tribunnews. This phenomenon ultimately shows that information values and religious values which were originally used as use values have changed into exchange values. The value of information is useful in increasing the knowledge and insight of the

recipient (communicant). Meanwhile, religious values can be used as moral enhancement for spiritual needs. However, these two things are captured by the media to be used as a commodity for profit, especially in Indonesia where the majority of the population is Muslim, so that the emphasis on Islamic values or symbols in the broadcasts that are presented has its own appeal.

Online Media as a Propaganda Tool

Tribunnews as an online media that has a broad enough appeal to the public has considerable power to carry out propaganda, in this case political propaganda. The existence of the media certainly cannot be separated from its role as a propaganda tool for parties who have interests, especially related to issues to defend or fight against the power that is currently standing. In this case, the existence of media that has the power to spread nationally ultimately becomes a consideration for many parties in the practice of spreading the ideology they hold.

Related to the context of political economy, especially propaganda, Edward S. Herman dan Noam Chomsky (1988) argues that propaganda can be seen in a media by focusing on 5 filters, namely (1) size, ownership, and profit orientation of the mass media, (2) advertising to do business, (3) sources of mass media in obtaining information, (4) flak or criticism as a means of disciplining the media, and (5) anti-communism as a means of social control. When viewed from the first filter, Tribunnews, which has many branches and is a group of Kompas Gramedia, in terms of business size and ownership, is a big business. Especially when viewed from the agencies under the parent company, it is undeniable that Tribunnews is a big media. This shows that the income from Tribunnews is certainly large. This phenomenon certainly has something to do with the advertisements that enter this media, so that Tribunnews' income and dependence on advertisers are more seen as private media.

In addition, a private media that operates within a country and has permission from the relevant country will certainly not be separated from existing regulations. The mass media, including online media which is known as the eyes and mouth of the people, will of course always show its independent attitude. Even though a media always wants to be in an independent position, it cannot be denied that the existence of a journalist as a social actor certainly has its own side. It is undeniable that even the media, for its survival, will have alignments as well. Like a media that lives from advertisers and rules from the government. Of course, this condition makes the media tend to take sides with these parties.

Media independence is ultimately difficult to achieve because private media, including Tribunnews, live through advertisers and are under government regulation. Including journalists who work and live under the media. Independence can be understood as the freedom of one party

without the interference of others. However, this is difficult for the mass media and journalists to obtain when there is dependence on one party in power or capitalism (Fazri, Hidayati, & Maulida, 2021: 96-98). Media independence is important to have, including its human resources, because the partiality of a media will lead to negative judgments from the public. This will be very felt for a media when its alignment is more inclined to the authorities or the capitalist side. The public will become the enemy of the media when this happens.

Tribunnews seems to have caught on to this threat so that in conveying the information and constructing the message through live reports it is presented more carefully. This is also helped by the noise that occurs during journalists delivering their coverage. Because in a live report a journalist must be careful in conveying messages because there is no editing and there are demands for the truth of the facts and the speed of publication. The position taken by Tribunnews tends to be in the middle, conveying information and trying not to be inclined towards one side, either the demonstrators or the government.

This also cannot be separated from the fact that the existence of the public or society in general is also very important for the life of mass media or online media. The importance of public existence because they are a commodity that is sold to advertisers. Without the interest of the public consuming this information, it can have implications for the income of a media. The public becomes a commodity when they are seen in numbers. For example in the form of the number of viewers on Youtube, subscribers, followers, likes, and so on. Where calculations in the form of accumulated numbers become very valuable for media institutions to attract advertisers.

The existence of society as a commodity for the media cannot be ignored. Dallas Smythe (Perdana, 2017: 15) explained that the mass media is an industry that not only produces information, but also produces audiences to be given to advertisers. This view shows that the existence of the public as a mass media audience is very important to gain profit. Audiences are not only seen as spectators who need information alone. They are also seen as labor or unpaid workers for the media. This shows that the audience has value as a mass media commodity to benefit advertisers.

This phenomenon also applies to online media, including YouTube, which relies on the accumulation of viewers, subscribers, comments and likes to attract advertisers. The accumulation is even more openly visible because the data is shared on the internet. Even the audience can also find out the accumulation.

When online media is seen as a propaganda tool, it is not only concerned with matters of economic interest. But in it is also an effort to build a discourse that needs to be thought about and contemplated by the public. In the view of Herman and Chomsky (1988) this is packaged in

the form of anti-communism. This is also related to the issue of anti-terrorism. This concept, when viewed in the current conditions, anti-communism and anti-terrorism are two things that are always packaged as enemies of the government and society. In this case there is a role of protagonist and antagonist. Protagonists are people and governments who are in a good position, while antagonists are communists and terrorists who are criminals.

Related to this phenomenon, the media also places these elements in framing the events they publish. When an event gets media attention for coverage, the event certainly has a strong value for publication. Action 411 framed by Tribunnews through a live report tries to take this logic. Where, implicitly and carefully, Tribunnews tries to place two parties in the position of protagonist and antagonist. This was also shown from the efforts of the demonstrators at the 411 action in their demands and the religious symbols they wore. The choice of religious symbols non-verbally conveys the message that they are on the side of society (as the protagonist). This is also emphasized in the message written in the description column that says *“Lalu ada juga spanduk bertuliskan kami yakin umat Islam yang datang dari seluruh Indonesia di 411 bukan hanya sekedar membela agama. Tetapi membela bangsa dan negara”*. The writing embedded in the description column shows that Tribunnews also tried to frame the message to show the position of the demonstrators.

By emphasizing this message, the government, in this case Jokowi, who was demanded to step down by the demonstrators, seemed to be placed in an antagonistic position. This construction is part of a subtly constructed message propaganda effort. When viewed from the delivery of messages by field journalists, this is not clear because of the noise caused by the technology used. However, this is clarified in the description column provided by Tribunnews. With the strengthening of religious symbols which are believed to be symbols of goodness, it raises the message that those who take action as if they are good parties who are fighting against injustice because there are demands against the government.

CONCLUSION

Tribunnews as one of the major online media in Indonesia which is under the auspices of Kompas Gramedia cannot be separated from its dependence on advertisers. This condition makes Tribunnews must continue to develop strategies to be able to attract audiences because they are commodities that can be sold to advertisers. This effort cannot be separated from the objective of private media in obtaining the maximum profit.

Faced with these conditions, Tribunnews eventually became an online media that also carried out commodification practices. Especially in this case the live report it presents. This commodification process takes values and signs from Islamic religious symbols. This symbol is

shown through the clothes worn by the demonstrators from the 411 action. The framing that was constructed by field journalists and editors from Tribunnews, who also conceptualized the visualization on the YouTube channel, strengthens the purpose of this commodification. In the end, religious values and symbols become a commodity for media owners to profit from their coverage.

The practice of media political economy carried out by Tribunnews is not only seen from that point of view. There is also a form of propaganda from the coverage presented by Tribunnews by constructing information from the 411 action. The important thing from this propaganda practice is the placement of the demonstrators as the protagonists and the government represented by Jokowi as the antagonist. The emphasis on this position is reinforced by the message presented, both in the video coverage and in the description column presented. In this case the Islamic Religion symbol is emphasized as the protagonist based on the message written in the description column.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Adi, K. M., Sujoko, A., & Antoni. (2021). Commodification via the New Media: Content, Audience, and Labour in GoJek's Go Food service. *Lentera: Jurnal Ilmu Dakwah Dan Komunikasi*, 5(1), 41–60.
- Dugal, A. B., & Bholey, M. (2019). Fashion as a Medium of Communicating Faith: A Phenomenological Study of the Sikh Identity. In N. Kalbaska, T. Sadaba, F. Cominelli, & L. Cantoni (Eds.), *Fashion Communication in the Dital Age FACTUM 19 Fashion Communication Conference Ascona, Switzerland* (pp. 152–161). Ascona: Springer.
- Farkas, J., & Neumayer, C. (2020). Disguised Propaganda from Digital to Social Media. In J. Hunsinger, M. Allen, & L. Klastrup (Eds.), *Second International Handbook of Internet Research* (pp. 707–723). Dordrecht: Springer.
- Fazri, A., Hidayati, R., & Maulida, D. (2021). Idealisme Wartawan Dalam Pemberitaan Media Massa. *SOURCE: Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi*, 7(1), 95–103.
- Herman, E. S., & Chomsky, N. (1988). *MANUFACTURING CONSENT The Political Economy of the Mass Media*. New York: Pantheon Books.
- Kellner, D., & Share, J. (2019). Representation of Class. *The International Encyclopedia of Media*
- The Political Economy of Muslim Identity in 411 Action ... 55-69 (Khairul Syafuddin)*

Literacy, 1–6.

- Muliawanti, L. (2018). Jurnalisme Era Digital: Digitalisasi Jurnalisme dan Profesionalitas Jurnalisme Online. *Lentera*, 11(1), 79–98.
- Perdana, D. D. (2017). Komodifikasi Dalam Tayangan Televisi (Kajian Terhadap Program Indonesian Idol 2014). *Jurnal Professional FIS UNIVED*, 4(1), 12–21.
- Preston, S. (2009). Introduction to Ethics of Representation. In T. Prentki & S. Preston (Eds.), *The Applied Theatre Reader* (1st editio, pp. 65–69). London and New York: Routledge Taylor & Francis Group.
- Rahmawati, I. (2017). Semiotik Roland Barthes dalam Kehidupan Kontemporer Umat Beragama Mengenai Fenomena Padu Padan Kebaya. *Jurnal Kebudayaan Dan Sastra Islam*, 17(2), 1–14.
- Rusadi, U. (2012). Kompetensi Jurnalis Sebagai Aktor Dalam Produksi Berita Media Multiplatform. *Jurnal Studi Komunikasi Dan Media*, 16(2), 111–122.
- Rustandi, R. (2018). Analisis Wacana Kritis Komodifikasi Daí dalam Program Televisi. *Communicatus: Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi*, 2(2), 197–222.
- Sapienza, Z. S., Iyer, N., & Veenstra, A. S. (2015). Reading Lasswell's Model of Communication Backward: Three Scholarly Misconceptions. *Mass Communication and Society*, 18, 599–622.
- Tribun Group of Regional Newspaper. (2022). Profil Tribunnews di LinkedIn. Retrieved November 19, 2022, from https://id.linkedin.com/company/tribunnetwork?original_referer=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.google.com%2F
- Tribunnews. (2022). Suasana Massa Aksi GNPR 411 yang Padati Kawasan Bundaran Patung Kuda Tuntut Jokowi untuk Mundur. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ijjfwOMnZA>
- Umam, K., & Sulaeman, M. (2022). *Isu-isu Islam Kontemporer Refleksi Kritis Kondisi Muslim di Indonesia*. Malang: CV. Literasi Nusantara Abadi.
- Wibisono, P., & Sari, D. Y. (2021). Analisis Semiotika Roland Barthes Dalam Film Bintang Ketjil Karya Wim Umboh Dan Misbach Yusa Bira. *Jurnal Dinamika Ilmu Komunikasi*, 1(1), 30–43.

Wijayanto, C. S., & Iswari, F. (2021). Semiotics Analysis of Roland Barthes ' Theory on Pocari Sweat ' s " Sweat for Dream " Advertisement. 3(2), 100-108.

Yelly, P. (2019). Analisis Makhluk Superior (Naga) Dalam Legenda Danau Kembar (Kajian Semiotika Roland Barthes; Dua Pertandaan Jadi Mitos). *Jurnal Serunai Bahasa Indonesia*, 16(2), 121-125.